



April 1, 2022

Michael S. Regan, Administrator  
United States Environmental Protection Agency  
Office of the Administrator: Mail Code 1101A  
1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW  
Washington, D.C. 20460  
[regan.michael@epa.gov](mailto:regan.michael@epa.gov)

VIA CERTIFIED MAIL, RETURN RECEIPT REQUESTED

**RE: Sixty-day notice of intent to file a citizen suit under Section 304 of the Clean Air Act for failure to make findings of attainment/nonattainment under the 2015 ozone standards and to publish reclassifications for Bexar County, Texas.**

Dear Administrator Regan:

With this letter, Alliance of Nurses for Healthy Environments, Downwinders at Risk, HEAL Utah, Public Citizen, and Sierra Club supplement the attached February 22, 2022 notice, which alerted the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency of the organizations' intent to commence a civil action challenging the EPA's failure to perform certain nondiscretionary duties under the Clean Air Act ("the Act"). *See* 42 U.S.C. § 7604(b)(2).

In our previous correspondence, we noted that under 42 U.S.C. § 7511(b)(2), the Administrator was required to determine, no later than February 3, 2022, whether over thirty marginal areas attained the 2015 ozone standard by their August 3, 2021 attainment date. We also noted that on July 25, 2018, EPA designated Bexar County, Texas as being in marginal nonattainment of the ozone standard, with an effective date of September 24, 2018. 83 Fed. Reg. 35,136 (July 25, 2018). We requested that EPA make and publish the attainment/nonattainment determination and any reclassification for Bexar County "within 6 months following the applicable attainment date"—that is, by March 24, 2022, at the latest. 42 U.S.C. § 7511(b)(2); 40 CFR § 51.1303; 83 Fed. Reg. 25,776 (June 4, 2018). And we requested that in the interest of efficiency and expeditious implementation of the Act, EPA should make the required determination and reclassification for Bexar County as part of the same action required for the other marginal areas we had identified, even if that action is completed before March 24, 2022. Unfortunately, EPA did not make determinations for any of the identified areas, including Bexar County, by March 24, 2022.

The Clean Air Act establishes each of the deadlines that the Administrator must follow. Under the statute, the Administrator is required to publish a Federal Register notice no later than six months after an area's attainment date stating whether the area did or did not timely attain the standard. 42 U.S.C. §§ 7509(c), 7511(b)(2). Any area that remains in violation of an ozone standard on its attainment date must be reclassified by operation of law to a higher classification. 42 U.S.C. § 7511(b)(2)(A); 83 Fed. Reg. 10,376 (Mar. 9, 2018). As a result, for each area that the Administrator

identifies as having failed to timely attain a standard, the notice must also identify the reclassification of such area to the appropriate higher classification. 42 U.S.C. § 7511(b)(2)(B).

The Administrator has failed to perform the above-described duties with respect to the Bexar County marginal nonattainment area. The outside attainment date of September 24, 2021 for this area passed more than six months ago, but the Administrator has not determined whether it has attained the 2015 primary ozone standard.<sup>1</sup> The Administrator is therefore in violation of his nondiscretionary duty to make such determination within six months of the attainment date. 42 U.S.C. § 7511(b)(2)(A). Further, the Administrator has not published a notice of his determination in the Federal Register and identifying its nonattainment reclassification, if one is required. The Administrator is therefore in violation of his nondiscretionary duty to publish such Federal Register notice within six months of the attainment date pursuant to 42 U.S.C. § 7511(b)(2)(B).

This notice letter is submitted on behalf of the following organizations:

Alliance of Nurses for Healthy Environments  
2901 Shepherd St.  
Mount Rainier, MD 20712

Downwinders at Risk  
1808 S. Good-Latimer #202  
Dallas, TX 76226

HEAL Utah  
824 S. 400 W., Ste. B111  
Salt Lake City, UT 84101

Public Citizen  
309 East 11<sup>th</sup> St., Suite 2  
Austin, Texas 78701

Sierra Club  
2101 Webster St. Ste. 1300  
Oakland, CA 94612

These organizations intend to commence a civil action to enforce the nondiscretionary duties described in this letter unless EPA has fully performed those duties within sixty days of the postmark date of this letter.

---

<sup>1</sup> On July 1, 2020, the Texas Commission of Environmental Quality submitted a §179B SIP revision and demonstration for Bexar County to EPA, requesting that EPA find the area in attainment “but for” emissions occurring outside of the U.S. *See* TCEQ Non-Rule Project No. 2019-106-SIP-NR. Under 42 U.S.C. § 7509a, the Administrator’s finding for Bexar County—and other nonattainment areas that have submitted §179B demonstrations—must include a determination on whether it has met the attainment deadlines based on this demonstration.

We would welcome the opportunity to meet with EPA to discuss the potential for promptly resolving this matter. If EPA is interested in pursuing discussions on the above matter, please contact the undersigned counsel at [mcbrown@earthjustice.org](mailto:mcbrown@earthjustice.org) and [janderson@aclpi.org](mailto:janderson@aclpi.org). If we do not hear from EPA in sixty days, we intend to proceed with filing a complaint in U.S. District Court.

Please direct any communications regarding this matter to the undersigned.

Sincerely,



Marvin C. Brown IV,  
Associate Attorney  
Sean Helle,  
Senior Attorney  
Earthjustice  
1001 G St. NW, Suite 1000  
Washington, DC 20001  
T: 202.667.4500  
F: 202.667.2356  
[mcbrown@earthjustice.org](mailto:mcbrown@earthjustice.org)  
[shelle@earthjustice.org](mailto:shelle@earthjustice.org)



Jennifer B. Anderson,  
Staff Attorney  
Arizona Center for Law in the Public Interest  
352 E. Camelback Road, Suite 200  
Phoenix, Arizona 85012  
T: 602.258.8850  
F: 602.926.0214  
[janderson@aclpi.org](mailto:janderson@aclpi.org)

# Attachment 1



February 22, 2022

Michael S. Regan, Administrator  
United States Environmental Protection Agency  
Office of the Administrator: Mail Code 1101A  
1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW  
Washington, D.C. 20460  
[regan.michael@epa.gov](mailto:regan.michael@epa.gov)

VIA CERTIFIED MAIL, RETURN RECEIPT REQUESTED

**RE: Sixty-day notice of intent to file a citizen suit under Section 304 of the Clean Air Act for failure to make findings of attainment/nonattainment under the 2015 ozone standards and to publish reclassifications of areas violating those standards.**

Dear Administrator Regan:

Pursuant to 42 U.S.C. § 7604(b)(2), the following organizations give notice of their intent to commence a civil action against the Administrator of the United States Environmental Protection Agency (“Administrator” or “EPA”) for failing to perform certain nondiscretionary duties under the Clean Air Act (“the Act”):

Downwinders at Risk  
1808 S. Good-Latimer #202  
Dallas, TX 76226

HEAL Utah  
824 S. 400 W., Ste. B111  
Salt Lake City, Utah 84101

Sierra Club  
2101 Webster St. Ste. 1300  
Oakland, CA 94612

As further specified below, the Administrator has failed to perform his duties to determine whether numerous ozone nonattainment areas timely attained the 2015 primary national ambient air quality standard (“NAAQS” or “standard”) for ozone, to publish his determination in the Federal Register, and to publish the required reclassification of each area that failed to timely attain that standard. 42 U.S.C. §§ 7509(c), 7511(b)(2).

Ozone, the principal component of smog, is one of the most dangerous and widespread forms of air pollution in the United States today. Scientists link ozone to premature deaths, thousands of emergency room visits, and tens of thousands of asthma attacks each year. Ozone is especially dangerous to small children, people with asthma, and the elderly, who are often warned to stay indoors on polluted days. Smog pollution also damages forests and plants, stunting their growth, increasing the risk of tree die-off from disease, and causing harms that affect whole ecosystems. Hundreds of counties throughout the nation suffer from unsafe ozone levels.

EPA revised the ozone standard in 2015 (80 Fed. Reg. 65,292 (Oct. 26, 2015)) and published nonattainment area designations and classifications for that revised standard on June 4, 2018 (83 Fed. Reg. 25,776 (June 4, 2018)) with an effective date of August 3, 2018. At that time, EPA designated and classified the following as marginal nonattainment areas for the 2015 standard:

Allegan County, MI  
Amador County, CA  
Atlanta, GA  
Baltimore, MD  
Berrien County, MI  
Butte County, CA  
Calaveras County, CA  
Chicago, IL-IN-WI  
Cincinnati, OH-KY  
Cleveland, OH  
Dallas-Fort Worth, TX  
Denver Metro/North Front Range, CO  
Detroit, MI  
Greater Connecticut, CT  
Houston-Galveston-Brazoria, TX  
Imperial County, CA  
Las Vegas, NV  
Louisville, KY-IN  
Manitowoc County, WI  
Mariposa County, CA  
Milwaukee, WI  
Muskegon County, MI  
Northern Wasatch Front, UT  
Philadelphia-Wilmington-Atlantic City, PA-NJ-MD-DE  
Phoenix-Mesa, AZ  
San Francisco Bay Area, CA  
San Luis Obispo (Eastern part), CA  
Sheboygan County, WI  
Southern Wasatch Front, UT  
St. Louis, MO-IL  
Sutter Buttes, CA  
Tuolumne County, CA  
Uinta Basin, UT  
Washington, DC-MD-VA  
Yuma, AZ

83 Fed. Reg. 25,776 (June 4, 2018); EPA, Green Book, <https://www3.epa.gov/airquality/greenbook/jnc.html> (data as of Jan. 31, 2022) (last visited Feb. 22, 2022).

The applicable outside attainment date for the above-listed marginal areas was August 3, 2021 (three years after the effective date of designation). 42 U.S.C. § 7511(a); 40 CFR

§ 51.1303; 83 Fed. Reg. 25,776 (2018). Pursuant to 42 U.S.C. § 7511(b)(2), the Clean Air Act requires the Administrator to determine within six months after the attainment date—that is, by February 3, 2022—whether each of the above-listed marginal areas attained the standard by the August 3, 2021 attainment date. Any area that the Administrator found had not attained the standard by that date was required to be reclassified by operation of law to a higher classification. 42 U.S.C. § 7511(b)(2)(A); 83 Fed. Reg. 10,376 (Mar. 9, 2018). Further, the Act required the Administrator to publish a Federal Register notice no later than six months following the attainment date identifying whether each of the above-listed ozone nonattainment areas did or did not timely attain the standard. 42 U.S.C. §§ 7509(c), 7511(b)(2). For each area that the Administrator identified as having failed to attain the standard, the notice had to also identify the reclassification of such area to the appropriate higher classification. 42 U.S.C. § 7511(b)(2)(B).

The Administrator has failed to perform the above-described duties with respect to the above-listed marginal nonattainment areas. The outside attainment date of August 3, 2021 for each of those areas passed more than six months ago, but the Administrator has not determined whether each area attained the 2015 primary ozone standard by the applicable attainment date. The Administrator is therefore in violation of his nondiscretionary duty to make such determination within six months of the attainment date. 42 U.S.C. § 7511(b)(2)(A). Further, the Administrator has not published a notice in the Federal Register determining whether each of the above-listed ozone nonattainment areas did or did not timely attain the standard and identifying the required reclassifications of each area that did not timely attain. The Administrator is therefore in violation of his nondiscretionary duty to publish such Federal Register notice within six months of the attainment date pursuant to 42 U.S.C. § 7511(b)(2)(B).<sup>1</sup>

This notice letter is submitted on behalf of the Sierra Club, Downwinders at Risk, and Heal Utah. These organizations intend to commence a civil action to enforce the nondiscretionary duties described in this letter unless EPA has fully performed those duties within sixty days of the postmark date of this letter.

We would welcome the opportunity to meet with EPA to discuss the potential for promptly resolving this matter. If EPA is interested in pursuing discussions on the above matter, please contact the undersigned counsel at [mcbrown@earthjustice.org](mailto:mcbrown@earthjustice.org) and [janderson@alcp.org](mailto:janderson@alcp.org). If we do not hear from EPA in sixty days, we intend to proceed with filing a complaint in U.S. District Court.

Please direct any communications regarding this matter to the undersigned.

---

<sup>1</sup> We also note that on July 25, 2018, EPA designated Bexar County, Texas as being in marginal nonattainment of the ozone standard, with an effective date of September 24, 2018. 83 Fed. Reg. 35,136 (July 25, 2018). EPA must therefore make and publish the attainment/nonattainment determination and any reclassification for that area “within 6 months following the applicable attainment date,” that is, by March 24, 2022, at the latest. 42 U.S.C. § 7511(b)(2); 40 CFR § 51.1303; 83 Fed. Reg. 25,776 (June 4, 2018). In the interest of efficiency and expeditious implementation of the Act, EPA should make the required determinations and reclassification for Bexar County as part of the same action required for the other marginal areas listed earlier in this letter, even if that action is completed before March 24, 2022.

Sincerely,



Marvin C. Brown IV,  
Associate Attorney  
Sean Helle,  
Senior Attorney  
Earthjustice  
1001 G St. NW, Suite 1000  
Washington, DC 20001  
T: 202.667.4500  
F: 202.667.2356  
[mcbrown@earthjustice.org](mailto:mcbrown@earthjustice.org)  
[shelle@earthjustice.org](mailto:shelle@earthjustice.org)



Jennifer B. Anderson,  
Staff Attorney  
Arizona Center for Law in the Public Interest  
352 E. Camelback Road, Suite 200  
Phoenix, Arizona 85012  
T: 602.258.8850  
F: 602.926.0214  
[janderson@aclpi.org](mailto:janderson@aclpi.org)